

UPSC CSE 2021 MAINS PAPER 5 JANUARY 09, 2022 GENERAL STUDIES IV ANSWER KEY

Question 1(a) : Identify five ethical traits on which one can plot the performance of a civil servant. Justify their inclusion in the matrix.

Answer: Ethics are **subjective standard** of rights and wrong. For a civil servant, acting ethically is of utmost importance. A **matrix of ethical traits** can be helpful in **performance evaluation** of civil servants as discussed below:

Ethical trait	Reason for inclusion
Integrity	Integrity is important for elimination of corruption; Best utilization of public resources; Pursuit of professional excellence; Leadership quality to act as a role model for others.
Selflessness	Helps in resolving conflicts of interest; Countering nepotism and cronyism; preventing misuse of entrusted public resources and authority.
Compassion	Brings empathy towards weaker section; Self-motivation to work for weak; Outcome and effectiveness orientation; An element of Emotional Intelligence
Objectivity	Makes a civil servant impartial and non-partisanship; Decisions based on merit without personal bias; Fairness in action; Efficiency orientation; Tolerance towards opposing views
Accountability	Makes civil servants answerable for their conduct and decision; Makes administration transparent and public oriented; Build public trust; Deter unethical conduct.

These five ethical traits form the **ethical foundation of a civil servant** and **other values** like non-partisanship, tolerance, responsiveness can **emanate** from them. These traits ensure that a civil servant **fulfils his professional obligation** even in adverse situations.

Question 1 (b) : Identify ten essential values that are needed to be an effective public servant. Describe the /ways and means to prevent non-ethical behaviour in the public servants.

Answer: The **essential values** needed to be an effective public servant are:

1. **Integrity:** Consistency in value system, thoughts and conduct.
2. **Objectivity:** Impartial decision making.
3. **Leadership:** Ability to lead subordinate towards desired goal
4. **Openness:** Being transparent and open to scrutiny.
5. **Responsiveness:** Addressing the demands of public.
6. **Empathy:** Feeling and acting towards elevating pain of public.
7. **Selflessness:** Action should not be self-oriented rather other oriented.
8. **Honesty:** Being Fair, trustworthy and sincere.
9. **Accountability:** Assuming responsibility and answerability for actions.
10. **Courage:** Ability to do what is required even if the odds are against.

Ways and means to prevent non-ethical behaviour in public servants are as follows:

1. Effective **laws, rules and regulations** that unambiguously define do's and don'ts along with a mechanism for **quick action for unethical conduct**.
2. **Cutting down on discretionary power and minimizing direct contact** between citizen customer and service provider to reduce rent seeking opportunities.
3. Effective use of **transparency and accountability tools** like RTI, social audits, e-governance etc. Providing **adequate protection to whistle-blowers** is also necessary.
4. **Better personnel management:** Selection of candidates with high ethical competence and awakened conscience, promotions based on performance and Periodic training.
5. **Proper rewards and punishment** mechanism in terms of **performance-based bonus** that encourage hard work and discourage non-ethical conduct.

The union of these essential values and these reforms can make public servants more effective and public oriented.

Question 2(a): Impact of digital technology as reliable source of input for rational decision making is debatable issue. Critically evaluate with suitable example.

Answer: Objectivity or rationality in decision making depends upon **availability, quantity and quality of data**. Excessive usage of digital technology has raised questions regarding its impact on quality of decisions.

Digital technologies can act as a **reliable source of input for rational decision** making as shown below:

1. Digital technologies have made it **easier to collect and collate data** and convert it into meaningful **information** using various algorithms. **For example:** Different surveys like census, NFHS etc. for deciding policy intervention.
2. Digital technology can enable **data sharing and monitoring** in real time, helping in identifying bottlenecks and undertaking necessary reforms. **For example:** online dashboards for tracking status of project implementation.
3. Digital technology helps in integrating data and information spread across different departments, ministries and geographies. Thus, providing holistic picture of situation and help in taking objective decisions.
4. Big data analysis can predict **future progression** of an event like climate change, Covid-19 outbreak etc. This gives a warning for making rational decisions and **course corrections**.
5. Digital technology has made it easier to **spread information and make people aware**. **For example:** promotion of Covid appropriate behaviour.

However, digital technologies may **not act as reliable source** of input for rational decision making as shown below:

1. Digital technologies may not capture all the set of data required for making rational decisions. **For example:** Unbanked people may be left out if economic policy is based solely on digital information.
2. Digital technologies have resulted in targeted messages changing the attitude of recipient and manipulating them. **For example:** During election campaigns.
3. Social media has created an **infodemic** of unverified information creating confusions and cognitive dissonance. **For example:** Various fake news related to Covid-19.

4. **Bounded rationality:** People act in accordance with their **own perception of situation**. So even when all information are available people may not act rationally.
5. Digital technologies are **devoid of human emotions**. Peoples are represented as set of 1s and 0s. Decisions based on such information can lead to **mechanical rationality** where principles of **compassion and fairness** are violated.

Thus, digital technology can provide information but objectivity of decisions is also based on **human values, attitudes and conscience**.

Question 2(b): Besides domain knowledge, a public official needs innovativeness and creativity of a high order as well, while resolving ethical dilemmas. Discuss with suitable example.

Answer: Indian civil service is dominated by **intelligent generalist officers**. While performance of their official function, they often **face multiple ethical dilemmas**.

Domain knowledge is important in resolving ethical dilemmas because:

1. Civil servants with domain expertise are able to **understand nuances and dynamics of particular field** that helps in resolving clash between conflicting values. For example: **E. Sreedharan**, metro man of India, is a civil engineer by education.
2. Government **functions** have evolved becoming more **specialized and sophisticated**, particularly with greater role of private players in service delivery. For example: properly framing government contracts are necessary for transparency and accountability.
3. Domain expertise in civil servants helps in **improving quality of decisions and service delivery**, thus **promoting public trust**. For example: Dr. Rajendra Bharud, the collector of Nandurbar, was able to manage second wave of COVID-19 in an effective manner because of his domain knowledge.
4. System of domain expertise also **promote merit, efficiency, objectivity** while reducing reliance on outside expert consultation.

Even in private sector, people in top management have domain expertise that help them resolve dilemmas. Tough important, domain expertise in not sufficient in all cases. **Innovativeness and creativity** are also required for resolving ethical dilemmas:

1. Ability to find out of box solution that can help in **reconciling seemingly diverging values/course of actions** to resolve ethical dilemmas. **For example:** Giving benefit of government scheme to someone lacking required document (Solution- Use of ICT to provide provisional documents).
2. Different experts may offer different suggestions/viewpoints for the same problem. A civil servant with creativity and innovation to **identify right kind of data and advice** for effective policy. **For example:** During Covid-19 management on questions of Lives vs Livelihood, different experts had varying opinions.
3. It is also important for solving emerging **inter-disciplinary problems** while working under **political, social and economic constraints**. **For example:** problem of bad loan is rooted in economic slowdown, wilful defaults, politics-business nexus and inability of banks to assess risk.

So, both, domain expertise and creativity are important quality of a leader which enables him/her to resolve various ethical dilemmas.

Question 3: What does each of the following quotations mean to you?

3(a) : “Every work has got to pass through hundreds of difficulties before succeeding. Those that persevere will see the light, sooner or later.-Swami Vivekananda

Answer: Perseverance is the ability to **sustain one’s efforts in face of immense difficulties**. Perseverance is the key to success in matters, small and big, as discussed below:

1. **Learning to walk** involves falling over many times, before the first step is put forward in an upright posture.
2. **Integrity in adulthood**, is built on years of value inculcation and **winning over temptations of dishonesty** – intellectual or material. For example, in **school** examinations, **project** dissertations, in **personal life**, etc.
3. **Gautam Buddha** subjected himself to the most severe **austerities**, intellectual queries and **debates**, before he could achieve **enlightenment**.
4. Mahama **Gandhi’s ‘experiments with truth’** involved **lying and stealing at immature age**. His approach to freedom struggle evolved in **contrasting ways between Chauri Chaura and Quit India** movement.
5. **Swami Vivekananda** himself was an **inquisitive young man**, questioning all dogmas. His open and **unsatisfied mind** led him to meet his future Guru Shree **Ramkrishna Paramhans** and in him he met **his mission** in life.

Difficulties, trial and tribulations, and failure are part of the way to success. Those who persevere see the light, which those who quit cannot.

Question 3(b): “We can never obtain peace in the outer world until and unless we obtain peace within ourselves.” – Dalai Lama

Answer: Peace is the **lack of conflict** and the condition of acceptance. Peace **allows individuals and society to reap healthy benefits** out of their potential.

Relevance of peace within ourselves, for peace in the world:

1. Peace within is the **key to good mental health**, which is crucial for roles as parents and children **at home**, soldiers **at borders**, leaders in **public life**, employees **at work** etc.
2. Inner peace helps promote **religious harmony**, which is the **anti-dote to communalism**.
3. When people are **satiated within**, incidents of **crimes like rapes, thefts, domestic violence, corruption** etc. are likely to be lower.
4. Inner peace is linked to **lack of greed**, which has repercussions against **inequality** of wealth, status and income, **rabid consumerism, climate change** etc.
5. Social conflicts like **Naxalism, separatism** etc. can be ascribed to lack of inner peace within individuals.

However, **peace within ourselves can also have negative repercussions:**

1. It can lead to **supine morality and unaware citizenry**. For example, **attitude of indifference** towards gender issues, sanitation etc.
2. Peace within can be a **barrier to intellectual growth**. For example, **acceptance of religious dogmas** can undermine **scientific explorations**.

Inner peace is the building block of peace in the world. But desire for peace must avoid the hazard of surrender to dogmas and conflicts.

Question 3(c): Life doesn't make any sense without interdependence. We need each other, and the sooner we learn that, it is better for us all." -Erik Erikson word

Answer: Interdependence is a basic fact of the world. From **ecology** to **astronomical** bodies, **family** to **nations**, we live in an interdependent world.

Importance of interdependence:

1. **Values:** Family, schools, friends, community shape value inculcation in individuals and weave **society's moral fabric**.
2. **Climate Action:** Common but differentiated responsibilities are due for effective action against **climate change** and **environmental damage**.
3. **Democracy:** System of institutional **checks and balances**, **distribution of powers** between judiciary, executive and legislature, or through **federalism** are necessary to sustain democracy.
4. **Emotional wellbeing:** Understanding the **emotional needs of self and others**, being understood emotionally is a manifestation of **interdependent reflection**.
5. **Scientific developments:** Dependence on **shoulders of intellectual giants** like Newton and Madhava, epistemology through **dissertations**.
6. **Heritage:** Intergenerational knowledge such as through **tribal knowledge systems**, oral traditions, **literature**, **religion** etc. are **sources of culture**

History, culture, ecology and development are all interdependent. **Global warming** and **development deficit** are the most instructive example of interdependence in modern world. To meet our individual needs, we **need to take care of surrounding society and nature**.

Question 4 (a) : Attitude is an important component that goes as input in the elopement of human How to build a suitable needed for a public servant?

Answer: Civil servants are the **face of the government**. A positive attitude is considered to be an **essential characteristic of a civil servant** who is required to function under **extreme stress**.

Suitable attitude needed for a public servant can be built through:

1. **Practicing compassion:** as a public servant needs to work for the **welfare of the masses**, compassion can help build a **suitable attitude**.
2. **Examples of great leaders:** public servants often find themselves in **position of ethical/moral dilemmas**. In such scenarios, life examples from **great leaders**, such as **Gandhi, Sardar Patel, Nehru** etc., can help in building positive attitude.
3. **Problem solving approach:** Learning **problem solving approach** will help create suitable **attitude for public servants** as they are required to **adopt innovative ways** to solve problems.
4. **Following just actions:** as public servants are required to **be just and non-partisan** in exercise of their duties.

5. **Imbibing moral values:** as public servant is expected to have **high integrity honesty** and is expected to act in a **responsible and transparent manner**, imbibing moral values in one's life can help build suitable attitude for a public servant.
6. **Inculcating patriotism:** As public servants are **supposed to uphold national interest**, imbibing patriotic values can create **desirable attitude**.

A human being at large is **defined by his/her attitude towards life**. A public servant, who has the **responsibility of the governance of the nation** need to develop **positive attitude** in order to serve **the country to the best of his/her ability**.

Question 4(b): In case of crisis of conscience does emotional intelligence help to overcome the same without compromising the ethical or moral stand that you are likely to follow? Critically examine.

Answer: Conscience is an **inner voice** that helps in **deciding what is ethical or moral**. Crisis of conscience (CoC) is a situation of confusion where either a person is **doing something that goes against his/her conscience** or voice of **conscience is not able to decide** what is ethically or morally correct (value conflict).

For example: Arjun faced crisis of conscience in the beginning of Mahabharat.

Emotional intelligence is the ability to regulate emotions of oneself and others while also **using emotions to make better decisions**. Crisis of conscience is an undesirable psychological state and **emotional intelligence can help** in overcoming it without compromising ethical/ moral standards as:

1. Emotional intelligence helps in **better understanding** of the **situation** and **long-term consequences** of one's action (**dispel ethical myopia**) making it easier to explore desirability and ethicality of any action. **For example:** whistle blowing.
2. It can help in **reconciling apparently divergent values** which may be causing the crisis of conscience. **For example:** EI can blend objectivity of law with subjectivity of emotions leading to **compassionate justice**.
3. Emotional intelligence gives **internal strength to individuals** that can enable them to act with integrity and withstand adverse situations. **For example:** Crisis of conscience is case of **coerced corruption** or an **order from senior** which goes against established ethical standards.
4. Emotionally intelligent persons are able to **persuade others and resolve conflicts**. **For example:** crisis of conflict for a DM arising due to diverging demands by different communities.
5. EI helps in **controlling selfish desires** resolving crisis of conscience arising in cases like **public vs. personal interest**.

Despite being important, sometimes, **EI may not be sufficient** in resolving crisis of conscience. In such cases **laws, rules, regulations and social values** can act as guides to ethical conduct and help resolve CoC.

Question 5(a): "Refugees should not be turned back to the country where they would face persecution or human right violation." Examine the statement with reference to ethical dimension being violated by the nation claiming to be democratic with open society.

Answer: Non-refoulment is a **principle that forbids a country from returning refugee** to a country where they may face persecution. However, countries claiming to be democratic with open society **often refuse to accept refugees** and send them back raising following ethical questions:

1. **National interest vs global responsibility:** Countries deny refuge citing **limited resources, security threats, primary responsibility towards their citizen**. However, responsibility as a member of global community is often violated. Nations justify their actions on utilitarian perspective (protecting their citizen) while neglecting deontological aspect (duty to protect) in dealing with refugees.
2. **Human rights** are inalienable rights to life, liberty and opportunity to realize one's potential. Turning back the refugees deny them their basic human rights.
3. Turning back those in need goes **against the Categorical imperative** of Kant as it **cannot** be made into a **universal principle**. Some countries are accused of using migrants as a tool of foreign policy as witnessed during **2021 Belarus–European Union border crisis**. This amounts to using people as means and not as end in themselves. Such actions do not pass the test of **Gandhiji's Talisman** (action keeping in mind the interest of weakest).
4. Most of the refugees **suffer without any fault** of their own. They become victim of violence due to **'accidents of birth'** being born in particular country (Syria, Afghanistan), into a persecuted community (Ahmadiyas, Rohingyas) etc. Denying them opportunity to escape violence and persecution goes against all ethical principle.
5. **Historical responsibility:** Western world is responsible for many refugee crisis. For example: **colonial exploitation** and policies (Sykes-Picot Agreement), **armed humanitarian intervention** leading to civil wars (Middle East), **climate refugee** etc. They should take historical responsibility for their actions.
6. **Standard of ethics in society: Dehumanizing refugee and refusal to recognize their suffering** set wrong example for future and lead to **decline in values like care, empathy, compassion in the society**.

Democratic liberal countries/societies with **resources and capacities** should accept refugees and allow them to **exercise their basic human right of life and pursuit of happiness**

Question 5(b): Should impartial and being non-partisan be considered as indispensable qualities to make a successful civil servant? Discuss with illustrations.

Answer: While impartiality **means acting without any bias**, non-partisanship is a **quality of being politically neutral**. These two are considered as **essential/foundational values** for a civil servant in discharge of his/her duties because:

Non-partisanship:

1. It entails that the civil servant will **serve the government of the day faithfully** without political bias. For example, a **resident commissioner** may have to **serve under governments of differing political ideologies** in centre and the state.

2. Will help a civil servant to **take decision without any fear/favour** to any political party and based on constitutional principles. For example, **during elections, non-partisanship** will aid a **DM/DC in discharging the duties of a RO effectively**.
3. It ensures an **effective/professional relationship** between the **elected representative and the civil servants**. For example, **non-partisanship**, will **enhance/maintain the credibility** of a **chief secretary**, irrespective of the **party in power**.

Impartiality:

1. **Helps a civil servant** to make decisions on **objective criteria** and not on biases and prejudices. For example, **impartiality** will help the **Chairman of the Finance commission**, in **recommending resources on objective criteria**, without a bias to his/her own home state.
2. It ensures an **amicable and effective relationship** between civil servant and the society/citizens. For example, an **impartial SDM/DSP** will **command respect** of the people, and **thus will gain their cooperation in various conflict management situations**.
3. It helps build **an equal attitude towards everything and everyone**. For example, impartiality will **aid a DM/DC in implementing benefits** under **PMMVY** without a **bias of caste or religion**.

Impartiality and non-partisanship are considered as the **essential qualities in a civil servant**. These are necessary because, **civil servants are expected/mandated** to act as per **law/constitution** in a **politically neutral** manner, **without any bias or prejudice**.

Question 6(a): An independent and empowered social audit mechanism is an absolute must in every sphere of public service, including judiciary, to ensure performance, accountability and ethical conduct. Elaborate.

Answer: Social audit (SA) is an exercise of evaluation of **performance of public services** conducted **jointly by service provider and public**, especially the beneficiaries. **MGNREGA** was the **first act** to make SA by Gram Sabha mandatory. Further, most states have setup **Social Audit Units (SAU)** to facilitate SA of programmes like PMAY, MDM, etc. **Meghalaya** has even provided **legal backing** to SA.

Social audit is must to ensure **performance, accountability and ethical conduct** because:

1. Social audit goes **beyond financial audit** of official records to **assessing the impact of public services in improving the quality of life** of beneficiaries. This helps in improving performance of various public services.
2. It **makes governance participatory** and **empowers beneficiary** by giving them power to seek answers from authority (jansunwais).
3. It makes system **more transparent** and improve record keeping practices in public offices. (Jansunwai + transparency -> accountability)
4. It **removes the accessibility gap** and helps in **building trust** between public and administration.
5. **Contempt provision** of judiciary has restricted even constructive criticism and legislature cannot discuss judicial conduct. Social audit can help in **improving**

justice delivery system by creating a **feedback mechanism** for judiciary and assisting in **judicial process reengineering**.

6. Service delivery agency becomes more **aware** of the **expectations of public** and public becomes aware of **genuine administrative constraints**. SA can provide insights that can help in **reconciling objectivity of procedures with subjectivity of public opinions**.

However, SA has not achieved its objectives due to lack of awareness, deficit in political and administrative will among other limitation. A national law mandating SA for public services can be a step forward.

Question 6(b): “Integrity is a value that empowers the human being.” Justify with suitable illustration.

Answer: Integrity in an individual indicates **soundness of moral principles**, the character of **uncorrupted virtues, uprightness, honesty and sincerity**. A person with integrity **gets empowered** through **his/her strong character**, build by consistently **following ethical and moral principles**:

1. **High standards of professional integrity:** Professional integrity exhorts one to work in an **open, transparent and responsible** way, thus empowering them professionally. For example, **Lal Bahdur Shastri**, resigned as a railway minister, taking responsibility for a train accident. His integrity was **instrumental in his becoming the 2nd PM of India**.
2. **Integrity in public life:** **T.N Seshan, 10th Chief Election Commissioner** of India, was chastised by **crony media and corrupt politicians** for his reforms in electoral practices. However, **his integrity** helped him to establish him as an icon of **transparency and efficiency**.
3. **Integrity in leadership:** **Mahatma Gandhi** revoked the Non-Cooperation movement **after the Chauri Chaura incident**. He had to face **severe criticism** from his followers. However, his integral approach was **instrumental in building of a non-violent freedom struggle**.
4. **Integrity in sports:** **Sachin Tendulkar, playing a cricket match**, decided to **walk off the ground**, after the **appeal by the bowler**, even though **he was declared as not-out** by the umpire. Although, **he could not make his hundred**, his integrity established him as an **honourable sportsman, respected worldwide**.

Integrity helps an individual to **resolve the conflict between one’s desires** on one hand and **one’s values, beliefs principles** on the other hand. It might appear as **self-defeating momentarily**, but it **empowers the human being** in the longer run.

Question 7: Sunil is a young civil servant and has a reputation for his competence, integrity, dedication and relentless pursuit of difficult and onerous jobs. Considering his profile, he was picked up by his bosses to handle a very challenging and sensitive assignment. He was posted in a tribal dominated district notorious for illegal sand mining. Excavating sand from river belt and transporting through trucks and selling them in black market was rampant. This illegal sand mining mafia was operating with the support of local functionaries and tribal musclemen who in turn were bribing selected poor tribals and had kept the tribals under fear and intimidation.

Sunil being a sharp and energetic officer immediately grasped the ground realities and the modus operandi followed by the mafia through their devious and dubious

mechanism. On making inquiries, he gathered that some of their own office employees are in hand and glove with them and have developed close unholy nexus. Sunil initiated stringent action against them and started conducting raids on their illegal operations of movement of trucks filled with sand. The mafia got rattled as not many officers in the past had taken such steps against the mafia. Some of the office employees who were allegedly close to mafia informed them that the officer is determined to clean up the mafia's illegal sand mining operations in that the district and may cause them irreparable damage.

The mafia turned hostile and launched counter-offensive. The tribal musclemen and mafia started threatening him with dire consequences. His family (wife and old mother) were stalked and were under virtual surveillance and thus causing mental torture, agony and stress to all of them. The matter assumed serious proportions when a musclemen came to his office and threatened him to stop raids, etc., otherwise, his fate will not be different than some of his predecessors (ten years back one officer was killed by the mafia).

a) Identify the different options available to Sunil in attending to this situation.

b) Critically evaluate each of the options listed by you.

c) Which of the above, do you think, would be the most appropriate for Sunil to adopt and why?

Question 8: You are Vice Principal of a degree college in one of the middle-class towns. Principal has recently retired and management is looking for his replacement. There are also feelers that the management may promote you as Principal. In the meantime, during annual examination the flying squad which came from the university caught two students red-handed involving in unfair means. A senior lecturer of the college was personally helping these students in this act. This senior lecturer also happens to be close to the management. One of the students was son of a local politician who was responsible in getting college affiliated to the present reputed university. The second student was son of a local businessman who has donated maximum funds for running of the college. You immediately informed the management regarding this unfortunate incident. The management told you to resolve the issue with flying squad at any cost. They further said that such incident will not only tarnish the image of the college but also the politician and businessman are very important personalities for the functioning of the college. You were also given hint that your further promotion to Principal depends on your capability in resolving this issue with flying squad. In the meantime, you were intimidated by your administrative officer that certain members of the student union are protesting outside the college gate against the senior lecturer and the students involved in this incident and demanding strict action against defaulters.

a) Discuss the ethical issues involved in the case.

b) Critically examine the options available with you as Vice Principal. What option will you adopt and why?

c)

Answer: a) The **ethical issues involved** in the above case are:

1. **Integrity:** The foremost ethical issue in this case is that of **professional integrity**. While the senior lecturer has **compromised his professional integrity**, the situation is also a test of my own **integrity**, as it creates a conflict between my **values/duty and personal interest**.
2. **Test of moral strength (morality):** The present situation is also a **test of my moral strength**, as one hand it is the **lucrative opportunity to become the principal** of the college and on the other hand it is the **duty to do the right thing**.
3. **Impartiality:** The present situation involves the **ethical issue of impartiality**, as the examination **procedure has to be fair for all**, any leniency for a few students will make the **process partial for other students**.
4. **Professional ethics:** The situation involves a **test of my professional ethics**. As it remains to be seen, if I can carry out my duty **without any considerations of fear or favour**.

b) The options available to me as a vice-principal are:

1. To **listen to the advice of the school management** and try to resolve the issue, at any cost, **without taking any actions** against the students.

Merits	Demerits
This option will save the reputation of the college, in short term. The college will continue to gain, political and financial patronage from the politician and the businessman. It might make the possibility of my elevation as principal more certain.	It will compromise the sanctity of procedures. It will be impartial for the other students. It will tarnish the credibility of the college. It will set a bad precedent for the future. It will compromise my own professional ethics/morality and integrity. It will aggravate the student protests.

2. To let the flying squad/concerned authorities take strict **action against the senior lecturer, and the two students**, according to the procedure, in a **fair way**.

Merits	Demerits
It will enforce the sanctity of procedures. It will enhance the credibility of the college. It will set a right precedent for the future. It will ensure check against corruption/malpractices by teachers. It will calm the protests by other students.	It might jeopardise future of the two children It might have financial implications for the college. It might lead to a bad publicity for the college. It will/might tarnish the reputation of the families of the concerned students. My chances of elevation will be diminished.

3. To **convince the flying squad not to take any action**, and thereafter, punishing the boys and the lecturer after **conducting an internal enquiry**.

Merits	Demerits
It will save the reputation of the college in the short term and its patrons. It will save the career of the two students and the lecturer. It will show my capability for crisis management.	It will aggravate the protests. It might encourage more such incidents in the future. It will compromise the sanctity of fair procedures.

I will **adopt the second option**. Even though, it **might bring a bad name** to the college and may **sabotage my promotion**, it is the right course of action because:

1. College is a place for students to **learn righteous values**. This option will teach the students **importance of ethics and morality**.
2. Also, **involvement of a senior lecturer** in the incident, highlights that the **situation requires strict action**.
3. As gaining **promotion by unfair ways**, will defy the sanctity of means, violating the principle of **purity of means and ends**.
4. This option will be **fair towards all the students** who were honestly writing their exams.
5. This option will **aid in pacifying the protests** by the students.
6. This option will uphold the **credibility of the college** as a fair and impartial institution.

Question 9: An elevated corridor is being constructed to reduce traffic congestion in the capital of a particular state. You have been selected as project manager of this prestigious project on your professional competence and experience. The deadline is complete the project in next two years by 30 June, 2021, since this project is to be inaugurated by the Chief Minister before the elections are announced in the second week of July 2021. While carrying out the surprise inspection by inspecting team, minor crack was noticed in one of the piers of the elevated corridor possibly due to poor material used. You immediately informed the chief engineer and stopped further work. It was assessed by you that minimum three piers of the elevated corridor have to be demolished and reconstructed. But this process will delay the project minimum by four to six months. But the chief engineer overruled the observation of inspecting team on the ground that it was a minor crack which to not in any way impact the strength and durability of the bridge. He ordered you to overlook the observation of inspecting team and continue working with same speed and tempo. He informed you that the minister does not want any delay as he wants the Chief Minister to inaugurate the elevated corridor before the elections are declared. Also informed you that the contractor is far relative of the minister and he wants him to finish the project. He also gave you hint that your further promotion as additional chief engineer is under consideration with the ministry. However, you strongly felt that the minor crack in the pier of the elevated corridor will adversely affect the health and life of the bridge and therefore it will be very dangerous not to repair the elevated corridor.

- a. **Under the given conditions, what are the options available to you as a project manager?**

- b. **What are the ethical dilemmas being faced by the project manager?**
- c. **What are the professional challenges likely to be faced by the project manager and his response to overcome such challenges?**
- d. **What can be the consequences of overlooking the observation raised by the inspecting team?**

Answer: a) options available to the project manager are as under:

1. I can **opt to continue with the work**, as my superior, the chief engineer, has overruled the observations of the inspecting team.
2. I can do **further survey into the problem**, and bring it into the notice of the **senior political leadership or the CM himself**.
3. As I believe that the **quality of the project is compromised** and have made my reservations about the same clear to my superiors, I can **request my transfer** from the project, to **avoid the responsibility** in case of a contingency.

b) **Ethical dilemma** faced by the project manager are as under:

1. **Personal interest vs public interest:** Going ahead with the **project will give an assured promotion**, however, it could possibly **put the life of many citizens** into severe jeopardy.
2. **Ends vs means:** While going ahead with the project **will fulfil the end of timely inauguration and my promotion**, it will **destroy the purity of means** involved.
3. **Cost vs quality of service:** While **demolishing the three pillars** will add to **cost and time over run** of the project, more so, when it is **deemed fit by the chief engineer**, continuing on the other hand will **compromise the quality-of-service delivery**.
4. **Administrative ethics vs work efficiency:** While for **completing the project on time**, the project manager will be **lauded for his efficiency**, it will **compromise his administrative ethics**.

c) **Professional challenges** likely to be faced by the manager are as under:

1. **Pressure from superiors:** As the **Chief engineer** has exhorted the **project manager**, to continue the work with same tempo.
2. **Political pressure:** As the contractor is a **relative of the minister**, and also, the CM intends to inaugurate the project before the elections.
3. **Career progression:** As the **career prospects of the project manager** are linked to the completion of the project.
4. **Possible responsibility:** In case the project **fails and the bridge collapses**, the project manager will be liable for a departmental/judicial enquiry.
5. **Corruption:** As the material **used was of poor quality**, the project manager faces the **challenge of tackling corruption** in his department.

The project manager can overcome these challenges by:

1. **Presenting a detailed report** on his assessment, and **sending a copy of the report** each to, the **CM, concerned minister, chief engineer, chief secretary** and the **vigilance officer** of the state.
2. **Conducting an enquiry**, into the **quality of the material used**, and sending a **show cause notice** to the **concerned persons** in case of an anomaly.

3. **Involving a third party**, for conducting an **independent survey** on the fitness/health of the corridor.
- d) **The consequences of overlooking the observations** of the inspecting team could be:
 1. The corridor might collapse, which could **cause a severe damage to the life/limbs and property** of the citizens.
 2. The **collapse will come at a bigger cost and time over run** in the project, as the whole project will have to be **started afresh**.
 3. The **failure of the project** will bring a **bad name both to the department and to the political leadership** of the state.
 4. **Overlooking the observations** of the inspecting team, will also **mean going easy** on the issue of **poor quality of material** used in the project.
 5. It will also have the **consequence of promoting nepotism** in the working of government project.

Question 10: The Coronavirus disease (COVID 19) pandemic has quickly spread to various countries. As on May 8th 2020, in India 56342 cases of corona had been reported. India with population of more than 1.35 billion had difficulty in controlling the transmission of Coronavirus among its population. Multiple strategies became necessary to handle this outbreak. The ministry of health and family welfare of India raised awareness about this outbreak and to take all necessary actions to control the spread of Covid 19. Indian Govt. implemented a 55-day lockdown throughout the country to reduce the transmission of virus. Schools and colleges had shifted to alternative mode of teaching-learning-evaluation and certification. Online mode became popular during these days

India was not prepared for the sudden onslaught of such a crisis due to limited in terms of human resource, money and other facilities needed for taking care of this situation. This disease did not spare anybody irrespective of caste, creed, religion on the one hand have and have not on the other. Deficiencies in hospital beds, Oxygen cylinders, ambulances, hospital staff and crematorium were the most crucial aspects

You are a hospital administrator in a public hospital at the time when Coronavirus had attacked large number of people and patients were pouring into hospital day in and day out

(a) What are your criteria and justification for putting your clinical and non-clinical staff to attend the patients knowing fully well that it is highly infectious disease and resources and infrastructure are limited?

(b) If yours is a private hospital, whether your justification and decision would remain the same as that of a public hospital?

Answer: As the administrator in a public hospital in the given situation, I have **conflicts within my professional roles** such as among my **responsibility** towards patients, my staff, the government and the general public. There are **moral demands on my conscience** as well.

a) Criteria for putting clinical and non-clinician staff to attend the patients:

1. The staff should not have **age or disease-vulnerability**.

2. Segregate **duties based on complexity** of task and **competence** of the staff. For example, to prevent fire incidents in ventilators.
3. Simple but meaningful tasks like **helping elderly make video calls** to family can be assigned to non-clinical staff.

Justification for having all of my staff attend to infectious disease:

1. **Consequentialism:** Not attending to demands of public health would exacerbate the health crisis and will lead to large number of deaths, **dysfunctional medical infrastructure and economy**.
2. **Kant's duty principle:** As public servant, I have duty towards the government, and by extension the public. **Dutifulness** requires me to **allocate resources for handling patients' needs**.
3. **Utilitarianism:** Larger **public interest** is served if patients are taken care of, such as in **control of pandemic**, and assistance in **economic recovery**.
4. **Common good:** I have **responsibilities towards my staff** for their welfare, but **common good lies in controlling pandemic** through effective and efficient public health system.
5. **Compassion:** Compassion for the people affected by pandemic, **preventing loss of lives like orphaned children, parents losing all their children**, sufferings due to the **crippled infrastructure**, motivate me.

b)As administrator of a private hospital,my commitment to public health would remain the same. I would take following **additional measures:**

1. I would make sure my staff has **sufficient protection from infection** such as through their **vaccination** and providing **protective gears** of good quality.
2. I would **attend to my staff's work load** as best as possible under given circumstances through additional hiring, rotational shifts, intermittent rest and breaks. The staff can provide care to patients only if they are themselves **mentally, emotionally and physically healthy**.
3. The **medical expenses would be graded** as per patients' economic abilities through **formal and informal methods of verification** like tax filings or assets. Changes in health care costs would attend to **needs of poor patients** and provide **motivational bonus to my staff** for their extra efforts.

Ethics as an **administrator in public or private hospital** during pandemic induce me to **render public service** in challenging times. As private administrator I have opportunity to **attend to the conflict in my conscience** through **extra care for my staff** and needs of **equity in healthcare**.

Question 11: A reputed food product company based in India developed a food product for the international market and started exporting the same after getting necessary approvals. The company announced this achievement and also indicated that soon the product will be made available for the domestic consumers with almost same quality and health benefits. Accordingly, the company got its product approved by domestic competent authority and launched the product in Indian market. The company could increase its market share over a period of time and earned substantial profit both domestically and internationally. However the random sample test conducted by the inspecting team found the product being sold domestically in variance with the approval obtained from competent authority. On further investigation it was also discovered that the food company was not only selling products which were not meeting the health standards of the country but also selling

the rejected export products in the domestic market. This episode adversely affected the reputation and profitability of the food company

- (a) What action do you visualize should be taken by the competent authority against the food company for violating the laid down domestic food standard and selling rejected export products in domestic market?**
- (b) What course of action is available with the food company to resolve the crisis and bring back its lost reputation?**
- (c) Examine the ethical dilemma involved in the case.**

Answer:

The given case study presents a **contest between public interest and profitability** in corporate governance and highlights the problem of **lack of ethics in private institutions**.

a) **Following actions can be taken** against the company by competent authorities:

1. **Recall and destroy:** As the products under question are eatable, they pose **danger to public health**. Company should be instructed to recall products from the market and **destroy them under supervision** of authorities.
2. **Monetary fine:** A substantial monetary fine should be imposed to **emphasize cost of ignoring public interest** in pursuit of short-term business profitability.
3. **Criminal proceedings** against top officials should be based on graded response **as per consequential impact** on public health, such as **carcinogenic or genetic impact, effect on children** etc.
4. **Cancel the approval** to sell domestically as well as for exports **till review and reapproval**. This will help protect against **loss of reputation for the country as a source**, and promote **respect for prescribed regulations**.

b) **The company can take following course of action to resolve the crisis and regain its reputation:**

1. **Public apology** should express genuine **regret for wrong conduct**.
2. Internal audit and enquiry should be pursued to **fix responsibility for the decisions** that led to the crisis.
3. Review company's values and **process of value inculcation among employees**, middle-management and top-leadership. **Changes in leadership** may be needed.
4. Changes in quality control governance with **direct line of communication** between top-leadership and factory floor can **put quality norms on a pedestal**.
5. **Communication** of the internal emphasis on **quality and health over short-term profits** should reflect in **benchmarking** as per national and **international best practices like 6-sigma**.

c) **The ethical dilemmas in the case are as follows:**

1. **Public health versus private profit:** Corporates have interests of private profits but they also have responsibility towards society. **Commerce without morality** is a one of the seven Gandhian sins.

2. **Kantian right versus National Interest:** Taking **strict action** if found rightful such as criminal proceedings **can affect investments**, create **sensationalism** and undermine **reputation of India** as source of food products-based exports.
3. **Common Good versus Business Interest:** Narrow focus on business interest has threatened common good from public health and exports.
4. **Varying compliance with standards** for exports and domestic market reflects lack of **respect for domestic regulation** and possibility of **racial prejudices** within company.

The **pursuit of value and not profits** must guide the conduct of corporates. **Trust and customer loyalty** are enviable values that a company can only build on foundation of ethical governance

Question 12: Pawan is working as an officer in the State Government for the last ten years. As a part of routine transfer, he was posted to another department. He joined in a new office along with five other colleagues. The head of the office was a senior officer conversant with the functioning of the office. As a part of general inquiry, Pawan gathered that his senior officer carries the reputation of being difficult and insensitive person having his own disturbed family life. Initially, all seem to go well. However, after some time Pawan felt that the senior officer was belittling him and at times unreasonable. Whatever suggestions given or views expressed by Pawan in the meetings were summarily rejected and the senior officer would express in the displeasure presence of others. It became a pattern of boss's style of functioning to show him in bad light highlighting his shortcomings and humiliating publically. It became apparent that though there are no serious work-related problems/shortcomings, the senior officer was always on one pretext or the other and would scold and shout at him. The continuous harassment and public criticism of Pawan resulted in loss of confidence, self-esteem and equanimity. Pawan realized that his relations with his senior officer are becoming more toxic and due to this, he felt perpetually tensed, anxious and stressed. His mind was occupied with negativity and caused him mental torture, anguish and agony. Eventually, it badly affected his personal and family life. He was no longer joyous, happy and other family members contented even at home. Rather without way reasons he would lose his temper with his wife and other family members. The family environment was no longer pleasant and congenial. His wife who was always supportive to him also became a victim of his negativity and hostile behavior. Due to harassment and humiliation suffering by him in the office, comfort and happiness virtually vanished from his life. Thus it damaged his physical and mental health.

- a. **What are the options available with Pawan to cope up with the situation?**
- b. **What approach Pawan should adopt for bringing peace, tranquility and congenial environment in the office and home?**
- c. **As an outsider, what are your suggestions for both boss and subordinate to overcome this situation and for improving the work performance, mental and emotional hygiene?**

d. In the above scenario, what type of training would you suggest for officers at various levels in the government offices? (Answer in 250 words)

Answer:

This is a case of **poor work culture**, abuse of authority, **lack of emotional intelligence** and inability to compartmentalize **personal and professional life**.

a. Following options are available with Pawan to cope up with the situation:

1. **Resign from the current position:** This amounts to escapism and lack of courage. His personal responsibilities would also suffer.
2. **Take leave from office:** This will give a short respite to Pawan but he will face same problems on rejoining.
3. **Seek transfer to other department:** This is an administrative decision with little control of Pawan over it.
4. **Ignore his senior at work:** Coordination in and quality of work will suffer. This may make him indifferent to work as whole.
5. **Address the root cause of the problem** as discussed in the next part.

b. Pawan should develop and exhibit emotional intelligence for bringing peace, tranquillity and congenial environment in the office and home. This can be done through:

Office	Home
Introspect his own action to answer two questions (i) Were his actions annoying his senior? (ii) What is the behaviour of his senior towards other newly transferred colleagues? Have an open conversation with his senior to (i) explain his concerns (ii) understand reason for his senior's action. This will give opportunity for course correction to Pawan and his senior. 3. If this does not work, bring the matter to the knowledge of his senior's boss and lodge a written complaint.	Discuss the matter with his wife explaining the issue he is facing in office. His wife will understand and support him. Develop adversity quotient and learn to separate professional and personal life.

c. As an outsider, my suggestion to the boss and subordinates are:

Boss	Subordinates
Respect your subordinates. They are the productive force behind your organization. Develop emotional intelligence, act like a leader and a role model. Give constructive criticism,	Work with dedication and commitment but not at the cost of self-respect/self-worth. Work is 'just a part of the life' not 'the life'. Enjoy small things in life and do not let work related tensions

not belittle others.	spill into your personal life.
----------------------	--------------------------------

d. I would suggest **following type of training** to the officers in government offices:

1. **Sensitivity training:** Being sensitive to how one's actions are impacting people around them.
2. **Role playing training:** To look into the situation from perspective of others to understand their problems and constraints.
3. **Assertiveness training:** Exercising **authority without being condescending** to others; build team spirit and foster cooperation.
4. **Relaxation training:** Physical exercise and meditation to **keep body and mind in good shape**; decreases negative thoughts and frustrations.
5. **Communication training:** Using **verbal and non-verbal cues** for effective communication.

The motive of this exercise is to increase **positivity in outlook**, promote **inclusiveness** and make **work culture conducive** for performance.